



**Committee and Date**

South Planning Committee

7 March 2017

**SOUTH PLANNING COMMITTEE**

**Minutes of the meeting held on 7 February 2017**

**2.00 - 4.14 pm in the Shrewsbury/Oswestry Room, Shirehall, Abbey Foregate, Shrewsbury, Shropshire, SY2 6ND**

**Responsible Officer:** Linda Jeavons

Email: linda.jeavons@shropshire.gov.uk Tel: 01743 257716

**Present**

Councillor David Evans (Chairman)

Councillors David Turner (Vice Chairman), Andy Boddington, Gwilym Butler, Nigel Hartin, Richard Huffer, John Hurst-Knight, Robert Tindall and Tina Woodward

**74 Apologies for Absence**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors William Parr and Madge Shingleton.

**75 Minutes**

**RESOLVED:**

That the Minutes of the meeting of the Central Planning Committee held on 10 January 2017 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

**76 Public Question Time**

There were no public questions or petitions received.

**77 Disclosable Pecuniary Interests**

Members were reminded that they must not participate in the discussion or voting on any matter in which they had a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and should leave the room prior to the commencement of the debate.

With reference to planning application 16/02758/FUL, Councillors Andy Boddington and Robert Tindall declared that they were members of The Shropshire Hills AONB Partnership.

With reference to planning application 16/02758/FUL, Councillor David Turner declared that he was a member of The Shropshire Hills AONB Partnership and The Shropshire Hills AONB Transition Board.

**78 Dun Cow Farm Rocks Green Ludlow Shropshire SY8 2DS (14/05573/OUT)**

The Principal Planner introduced the application and with reference to the drawings displayed, she drew Members' attention to the location and indicative layout.

Members had undertaken a site visit on a previous occasion and had viewed the site and assessed the impact of the proposal on the surrounding area.

Members noted the additional information as set out in the Schedule of Additional Letters circulated prior to the meeting.

Mr D Appleton, representing Love Ludlow Campaign, spoke against the proposal in accordance with the Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

Mr R Heighway, a local resident, spoke against the proposal in accordance with the Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

Councillor C Sheward, representing Ludlow Town Council, spoke against the proposal in accordance with the Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

Councillor P Lawley, representing Ludford Parish Council, spoke against the proposal in accordance with the Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

With the permission of the Chairman and due to the fact that additional speakers had been permitted to speak against the proposal, the applicant was permitted to speak for up to six minutes. Mr S McGrath, the applicant, spoke for the proposal in accordance with the Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees and responded to questions from the Committee regarding shopping habits, the impact the proposal would have on the vitality and viability of Ludlow town centre and the impact on Ludlow town centre if an alternative supermarket chain other than Lidl chose to develop a store on the Rocks Green site.

In the ensuing debate, Members noted the comments of all speakers and considered the submitted plans. Members held differing views with some expressing concerns regarding the impact on the hinterland, Ludlow town centre, highway safety and access arrangements. Other Members supported the proposal; commented that the proposal would create employment; acknowledged that the application was an Outline application and the layout was not for consideration at this time; and any future application for reserved matters could be determined by this Committee.

In response to questions from Members, the Principal Planner drew Members' attention to the comments of Shropshire Council Highway Officers and reiterated that highway grounds would not be significant enough to justify refusal. She reiterated that the applicant was entitled to submit an Outline application and there was no justifiable reason for Shropshire Council to request a full application. Shropshire Council Officers had considered the submitted indicative layout as being unsuitable but were of the opinion that a different layout that would protect the residents of

Rocks Green could be achieved. She further drew Members' attention to the Retail Impact Assessment as set out in the report; and explained that a condition restricting the proposal to a named foodstore chain might present a risk of other foodstore chains challenging the consent.

**RESOLVED:** That,

- Subject to consultation with the Secretary of State and the conditions set out in Appendix 1 of the report, the Planning Services Manager be granted delegated authority to grant planning permission; and
- Any subsequent application for reserved matters to be determined by this Committee.

*(At this juncture, the meeting adjourned at 3.22 pm and reconvened at 3.29pm.)*

**79 Proposed Holiday Chalets At Upper Marsh Catherton Shropshire (16/02758/FUL)**

The Principal Planner introduced the application and with reference to the drawings displayed, he drew Members' attention to the location, layout and elevations.

Members had undertaken a site visit the previous day and had viewed the site and assessed the impact of the proposal on the surrounding area.

Members noted the additional information as set out in the Schedule of Additional Letters circulated prior to the meeting which included a statement from Councillor Madge Shineton, one of the two Local Ward Members.

Councillor G Wadsworth, representing Farlow Parish Council, spoke against the proposal in accordance with the Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

Mr P Harding, the applicant, spoke for the proposal in accordance with the Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15) Councillor Gwilym Butler, as local Ward Councillor, made a statement. He then left the table, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item. During his statement, the following points were raised:

- There was a lack of holiday accommodation in the area, major hotels and accommodation that was suitable for use by schools;
- Would help support the public house that had recently opened in the area;
- Would help to encourage income into a low wage economy;
- Family work closely with the local community, are well respected and would abide by any conditions;
- Diversification should be supported; and
- The benefits of the scheme would outweigh the harm raised by the objectors.

In the ensuing debate, Members noted the comments of all speakers and considered the submitted plans. Some Members considered that the proposal should not be supported given the continued objection of Natural England. Other Members supported the proposal subject to appropriate conditions regarding layout, materials and a register of occupation to ensure the chalets are used and remain as holiday accommodation.

In response to questions from Members, the Principal Planner explained that if Members were minded to grant consent contrary to the advice of Natural England a notice of the permission and a statement to include the reasons for departing from their advice would have to be sent to Natural England, following which the application may have to come back to Shropshire Council for reconsideration. He further provided advice regarding the guidelines relating to the granting of a temporary consent, definition of a caravan and occupancy of holiday lets.

**RESOLVED:**

That, as per the Officer's recommendation, planning permission be refused for the following reasons:

1. It is acknowledged that the proposed development would contribute to the rural economy and to the role of Shropshire as a tourist destination to stay. However these benefits are considered to be outweighed by the following environmental harm.

The principle of the proposed change of use of agricultural land and the erection of four holiday chalets in this remote and unsustainable rural area is contrary to both local and national policy planning policy which aims to locate this type of development adjacent to existing settlements or close to existing facilities. The introduction of significant new built form in to this very open location would detract from the visual amenity of the area and fails to respect the local distinctiveness of this part of Upper Marsh. The proposed log cabins and associated hard landscaping would appear as incongruous additions to the area and as such would result in a detrimental impact upon the character and appearance of the area. Accordingly, the proposed development is contrary to Local Plan policies CS5, CS6, CS16 & CS17 of the adopted Core Strategy and policies MD2, MD11, MD12 of the SAMDev and national guidance contained within the NPPF, in particular paragraphs 7, 17, 28, 58 and 109.

2. The application site is adjacent to Catherton Common (SSSI and SWT Reserve) and within both a buffer zone and 'corridor' of the Shropshire Environmental Network. Therefore, the proposed scheme must clearly demonstrate how the development will promote the preservation, restoration and re-creation of priority habitats and ecological networks. It is not considered that the level of suggested ecological enhancement will balance the likely adverse drainage impacts on the SSSI associated with the development. Furthermore, no consideration has been given to the additional recreational pressure on the SSSI and the Shropshire Wildlife Trust Reserve which could occur as a result of the proposed new tourism enterprise. Accordingly, the proposed development is contrary to policies CS17 and CS18 of the adopted

Core Strategy and policy MD12 of the SAMDev and national guidance contained within the NPPF and in particular paragraphs 109 and 118.

**80 Schedule of Appeals and Appeal Decisions**

**RESOLVED:**

That the Schedule of Appeals and Appeal Decisions for the southern area as at 7 February 2017 be noted.

**81 Date of the Next Meeting**

**RESOLVED:**

That it be noted that the next meeting of the South Planning Committee will be held at 2.00 pm on Tuesday, 7 March 2017 in the Shrewsbury Room, Shirehall, Shrewsbury, SY2 6ND.

Signed ..... (Chairman)

Date: .....